

# CRA Snowbird Peer Review Panel

---

Lance Fortnow  
Northwestern University

Community



# Scientific Annual Meetings

# Scientific Annual Meetings

- Mathematics: 5,700 January Annual Meeting



# Scientific Annual Meetings

- Mathematics: 5,700 January Annual Meeting
- Physics: 12,000 (Split into March/April Meetings)

# Scientific Annual Meetings

- Mathematics: 5,700 January Annual Meeting
- Physics: 12,000 (Split into March/April Meetings)
- Economics: 10,665 January Annual Meeting



# Scientific Annual Meetings

- Mathematics: 5,700 January Annual Meeting
- Physics: 12,000 (Split into March/April Meetings)
- Economics: 10,665 January Annual Meeting
- Chemistry: 12,000 (each at Fall/Spring Meetings)



# Scientific Annual Meetings

- Mathematics: 5,700 January Annual Meeting
- Physics: 12,000 (Split into March/April Meetings)
- Economics: 10,665 January Annual Meeting
- Chemistry: 12,000 (each at Fall/Spring Meetings)
- Computer Science: 0
  - No ACM Annual Meeting since 1984
  - FCRC Meeting Every 4 Years
    - 2,806 Registrants in 16 Conferences/Workshops (2007)



# Scientific Annual Meetings

- Mathematics: 5,700 January Annual Meeting
- Physics: 12,000 (Split into March/April Meetings)
- Economics: 10,665 January Annual Meeting
- Chemistry: 12,000 (each at Fall/Spring Meetings)
- Computer Science: 0
  - No ACM Annual Meeting since 1984
  - FCRC Meeting Every 4 Years
    - 2,806 Registrants in 16 Conferences/Workshops (2007)
- Theoretical Computer Science
  - STOC 2010: 350 Participants
  - STOC 1987: 500 Participants



# Role of Conferences

- Rate Publications and Researchers
- Dissemination of Results and Ideas
- Promote Yourself, Your Students, Your Agenda
- Discuss Controversial Subjects in Community
- Network, Gossip and Recruit



# Role of Conferences

- Rate Publications and Researchers
- Dissemination of Results and Ideas
- Promote Yourself, Your Students, Your Agenda
- Discuss Controversial Subjects in Community
- Network, Gossip and Recruit

“A Computer Science conference is just a journal that happens to meet at a hotel”

# Problems



# Problems

- “Pay to Play” – To have paper published requires an author to attend conference
  - Hotel, Travel, Registration > \$1000
  - Time Commitment

# Problems

- “Pay to Play” – To have paper published requires an author to attend conference
  - Hotel, Travel, Registration > \$1000
  - Time Commitment
- Subfields feel their papers aren't well represented and break off with own conference.



# Problems

- “Pay to Play” – To have paper published requires an author to attend conference
  - Hotel, Travel, Registration > \$1000
  - Time Commitment
- Subfields feel their papers aren't well represented and break off with own conference.
- Limited resources to attend ever growing number of conferences
  - Most Attendees either authors or locals



# Problems

- “Pay to Play” – To have paper published requires an author to attend conference
  - Hotel, Travel, Registration > \$1000
  - Time Commitment
- Subfields feel their papers aren't well represented and break off with own conference.
- Limited resources to attend ever growing number of conferences
  - Most Attendees either authors or locals
- “I don't have a paper there”



# Alternatives

# Alternatives

- Remove Competitive Submissions from Conferences
  - Accept most reasonable submissions
  - Several plenary and invited talks
  - Smaller specialized workshops
  - Annual CS Meeting built around recruiting



# Alternatives

- Remove Competitive Submissions from Conferences
  - Accept most reasonable submissions
  - Several plenary and invited talks
  - Smaller specialized workshops
  - Annual CS Meeting built around recruiting
- Publishing
  - Journals
  - Program Committee model without conference
  - On-line archives with reviewing/rating



# Conclusion

- Computer Science conferences play the role of journals in other communities instead of their critical role of bringing research communities together.
  - Most agree we have a problem.
  - Few agree on a solution.
- Further Reading
  - CACM Article “Time for CS to Grow Up”
    - <http://bit.ly/cacm-growup>
  - <http://futureofstoc.blogspot.com>